

**Report of the Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association
respecting its participation in the
62nd Annual Session of the NATO Parliamentary Assembly**

Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association (NATO PA)

**18-21 November 2016
Istanbul, Turkey**

Report

Introduction

The Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association has the honour to present its report on its participation at the NATO Parliamentary Assembly's (NATO PA) 62nd Annual Session in Istanbul, Turkey, 18 – 21 November 2016. The delegation was led by then-Association Chair Mr. Jean Rioux, M.P., and included from the Senate the Honourable Raynell Andreychuk, the Honourable Joseph Day, the Honourable Jane Cordy and the Honourable Vernon White, and from the House of Commons Mr. Steven MacKinnon, M.P., Mr. Pierre Paul-Hus, M.P., Mrs. Cheryl Gallant, M.P., Mr. Matt Jeneroux, M.P., and Mr. David Christopherson, M.P. The delegation was accompanied by Melissa Radford, the Association's Advisor, and Association Secretary Jean-François Pagé.

The 62nd Annual Session was hosted by the Turkish parliament and chaired by NATO PA President, Mr. Mike Turner, Member of Congress from the United States (U.S.). More than 800 parliamentarians and observers from NATO member countries, North Africa, the Middle East and Central Asia participated in the session.

THE NATO PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY

The NATO PA is an inter-parliamentary organization of legislators from the national parliaments of member countries of the North Atlantic Alliance, as well as 14 associate members. It is completely independent of the official NATO structure¹. As the NATO PA's website notes, "Its principal objective is to foster mutual understanding among Alliance parliamentarians of the key security and defence challenges facing the transatlantic partnership."²

Canadian parliamentarians draw significant benefit from their participation in NATO PA events. In addition to gaining a better understanding of strategic issues facing the Alliance and Canada, they are presented with the opportunity to promote Canadian interests and policy priorities in the course of discussions at the NATO PA, its committees and during informal meetings with counterparts from NATO member and non-member states.

MAIN ISSUES

The agenda of the 62nd Annual Session of the NATO PA included a number of topics that have been of interest to the NATO PA for some time and that are of importance to Canada, such as:

1. The current political and security situation in Turkey;
2. NATO operations, particularly in Afghanistan, Eastern Europe and the Baltics, Iraq, and maritime operations;

¹ See NATO PA, "[About the NATO Parliamentary Assembly](#)."

² Ibid.

3. Ongoing developments in the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region and their implications for international security, with a particular focus on Syria, Libya, and the ongoing refugee/migrant crisis;
4. The political and security situation in Ukraine;
5. Russia's role in the region and NATO-Russia relations;
6. The role of women in peace and security;
7. NATO enlargement and Montenegro's accession to NATO;
8. Defence spending and burden sharing;
9. NATO's implementation of commitments made at the Wales and Warsaw Summits;
10. NATO partnerships with other states and international organizations;
11. The growing strategic relevance of the Asia-Pacific region; and
12. Iran's nuclear program.

NATO PA BUSINESS

The first meeting of each Annual Session, the Standing Committee Meeting, is attended by Heads of Delegation, NATO PA Bureau members (President, Vice Presidents and Treasurer), Chairpersons of Committees and Subcommittees, and Rapporteurs only. Due to the key positions held by Canadian parliamentarians within the NATO PA, a number of Canada's delegates were in attendance. The purpose of the meeting was to update the NATO PA's 2016 programme and plan the upcoming activities in 2017.

MEETING WITH CANADIAN REPRESENTATIVES IN TURKEY

Members of the Canadian delegation had the opportunity to meet with Canada's diplomatic representatives in Turkey, Mr. Chris Cooter, Canada's Ambassador to Turkey and Mr. Ulric Shannon, Canada's Consul General in Istanbul. They described the current political and security situation in Turkey, particularly in light of recent terrorist attacks across the country and in the aftermath of the July 2016 attempted coup against the Government of Turkey. The officials also provided delegates with an overview of current Canada-Turkey diplomatic, trade and cultural relations. Ambassador Cooter is also accredited to Georgia, Azerbaijan and Turkmenistan and in that capacity, described Canada's relationship with Georgia while also updating the delegation on Georgia's accession process to become a NATO member.

COMMITTEE BUSINESS

The NATO PA has five Committees: the Defence and Security Committee, the Political Committee, the Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security, the Science and Technology Committee, and the Economics and Security Committee. Each of these Committees has one or two Subcommittees. Similar to Parliamentary committees, Committee members hear from defence and security experts and conduct fact-finding missions throughout the year, which culminate in the drafting of reports and resolutions. Committee members deliberate over these draft reports and resolutions at NATO PA Sessions and therefore the bulk of the Sessions' work is conducted during Committee meetings.

Before the Committee meetings began, delegates had the opportunity to meet with their counterparts from their respective political groups from across the Alliance: Conservative, Christian Democrat and Associates; Alliance of Liberals and Democrats; and, Socialists. This allowed NATO parliamentarians from similar political parties to discuss issues of mutual interest to their own parties and constituents, further solidifying the nature of democratic debate and parliamentary diplomacy that takes place within the NATO PA.

NATO PA Committees then met simultaneously for the next two days. During these meetings, Committees debated the reports and resolutions drafted by their respective Rapporteurs that were first presented at the Spring Session in Albania in May 2016. These reports and resolutions were open for final amendments before being put to a vote in their respective Committees. In addition, these meetings were an opportunity for delegates to hear from academic experts as well as senior military and government officials from Turkey, from NATO headquarters, the European Union (EU) and from non-governmental organizations (NGO) on issues of interest to the Alliance.

1. Defence and Security Committee³

Over two days, the Defence and Security Committee heard from four speakers. The first speaker was Ambassador Basat Öztürk, Deputy Undersecretary from Turkey's Ministry of National Defence. Ambassador Öztürk outlined what he viewed as the main threats currently facing the Alliance. He argued, however, that the principle threat comes from within the Alliance, notably the lack of cohesion and solidarity among member countries. He stated that Turkey has felt this lack of support from the Alliance particularly as it confronts a number of significant security challenges, such as the conflict in neighbouring Syria and the resulting refugee population within its borders, the terrorism threat from Daesh, the PKK (Kurdish Worker's Party)⁴, and the perpetrators of the July 2016 failed coup attempt. The EU's ongoing unwillingness to invite Turkey to become a member has also resulted in resentment and frustration within Turkey. NATO parliamentarians reassured the Ambassador of their solidarity with Turkey while also taking the opportunity to question him regarding his government's human rights record

³ A more detailed summary of the meetings can be found at: [Annual Session – Defence and Security Committee](#).

⁴ The PKK was formed in the late 1970s and began a campaign of guerrilla warfare and terrorism against the Turkish and Iraqi governments, calling for an independent Kurdish state in Southeast Turkey and Northern Iraq. The Government of Canada listed the PKK as a [terrorist entity](#) in 2002.

following the failed coup attempt, particularly the arrest of parliamentarians, journalists, and judges, among others.

The Committee then heard from Lieutenant General (LGen) Frederick Ben Hodges, Commanding General, United States Army Europe. LGen Hodges argued that the reduction of U.S. Army troops in Europe and the region's increasingly complex security environment have highlighted a number of challenges for European militaries. For instance, the movement of troops and equipment in Europe remains difficult due to political and logistical obstacles. Although improving diplomatic clearance for troop and equipment movement, and upgrading legacy railhead designs in Eastern Europe and Germany have helped, he suggested that Europe could do more by establishing a military Schengen Zone for NATO member states. LGen Hodges reasoned that greater freedom of movement is necessary to match Russia's ability to rapidly move military equipment to its western border. Following the results of the November 2016 U.S. election, Mr. Pierre Paul-Hus, M.P., asked LGen Hodges how the Trump administration would impact U.S. commitments to NATO. LGen Hodges responded first and foremost by thanking Canada for its contributions to Ukraine and Latvia. He then explained that successive administrations have remained committed to European security and that he did not foresee a change in this policy or any impact on current NATO operations. He further noted that there remains strong support from both Republicans and Democrats to maintain a U.S. military presence in Europe.

On the second day of meetings, the Committee heard from Vice Admiral (VAdm) Clive Johnstone, Commander, NATO Allied Maritime Command (MARCOM). VAdm Johnstone outlined the role of NATO MARCOM which, in addition to maritime operations, includes deterrence missions and missions to project stability in volatile regions. He also discussed today's primary maritime threats, including the growing strategic competition with Russia in the maritime domain; the effects of the conflicts in Syria and Libya particularly in the Southern Mediterranean; and ongoing uncertainty in the region surrounding the Black Sea, predominantly in Ukraine and Georgia. VAdm Johnstone ended his presentation with an update on ongoing NATO maritime operations.

Lastly, the Committee heard from General Hulusi Akar, Chief of the General Staff of the Turkish Armed Forces. General Akar first outlined the threats facing NATO from the East and the South while noting that Turkey is at the centre of this arc of instability, between Iraq and Syria as well as the Black Sea and Ukraine. He noted that while Turkey has spent billions of dollars to help and support the Syrian refugees within its borders, the international community has failed to act. He also highlighted the importance of NATO's ongoing role in Afghanistan, and pledged Turkey's continued commitment to NATO's current RESOLUTE SUPPORT mission in that country. General Akar then described the terrorist threats against Turkey emanating from Daesh, the PKK, the YPG (People's Protection Units)⁵ and the Fethullah Terrorist Organisation (FETO). FETO, as named by the Government of Turkey, is comprised of the followers of Fethullah Gülen, the imam who has been accused of masterminding the failed coup

⁵ The [YPG](#) is the armed wing of the Syrian Kurdish Democratic Union Party. While the Government of Turkey considers it a terrorist organization, the Government of Canada does not. YPG forces have been a key U.S. ally in the fight against Daesh.

attempt in Turkey and currently residing in the U.S. Mrs. Cheryl Gallant, M.P., asked the General about the nature of the evidence against FETO. He responded that the evidence includes statements, videos, and pictures.

Four draft reports were considered at the meetings⁶. As Acting General Rapporteur, Senator Joseph Day presented two of the draft reports entitled NATO's New Deterrence Posture: From Wales to Warsaw and NATO's Resolute Support Mission in Afghanistan 2016, as well as the two related draft resolutions. After some discussion, the reports and resolutions were adopted by Committee members with agreed upon amendments. The Committee also discussed its studies and activities for 2017 and elected Committee and Sub-Committee officers. Senator Joseph Day was elected as General Rapporteur for the Defence and Security Committee. Mr. Jean Rioux, M.P., Mrs. Cheryl Gallant, M.P., and Mr. Pierre Paul-Hus, M.P., were the Canadian delegates who participated in these discussions.

2. Political Committee⁷

The Political Committee heard from four speakers. Mr. Mevlüt Çavuşoğlu, Turkey's Minister of Foreign Affairs, provided an overview of Turkey's threat perspective, particularly the security challenges emanating from NATO's southern flank. He highlighted Turkey's fight against terrorism and its contributions to addressing the refugee crisis. He stressed that these contributions were not being sufficiently recognized by Allies and that Turkey needed more assistance from the Alliance and the EU. The discussion period focussed on the Turkish government's response to the failed coup attempt. Several delegates condemned the act while also pressing Turkey to strike the necessary balance between civil liberties and state security. The Minister defended his government's actions to date, stating that those involved must be held accountable and that his government would uphold the rule of law and follow a transparent process.

The second speaker was Mr. James Sheer, an Associate Fellow at the Royal Institute of International Affairs and expert on Russia and Eurasia. He touched on NATO-Russia relations as well as Russia's objectives regarding its neighbouring states and in Syria. Mr. Sheer commented that Russia's priority areas included the area encompassing the Caucuses, the greater Black Sea region and the eastern Mediterranean. Ukraine is another priority for Russia as is its relationship with the Assad Regime in Syria, in both cases this includes securing Russian naval facilities in those countries. Russia has also recently sought closer cooperation with Turkey. He concluded that the current challenge is how to intelligently manage what has become an antagonistic relationship between the West and Russia. He argued that NATO should stay the course on its planned defence and deterrence measures on its Eastern flank and that Allies should express solidarity on this commitment at the upcoming NATO Leaders Summit in May 2017.

⁶ The [reports](#) are: "NATO's New Deterrence Posture: from Wales to Warsaw," "NATO and the Future role of Naval Power," "The International Military Campaigns against Daesh," and "NATO's Resolute Support Mission in Afghanistan 2016." The Resolutions are available on the NATO PA website: "[Policy Recommendations 2016](#)."

⁷ A more detailed summary of the meetings can be found at: [Annual Session – Political Committee](#).

Next, delegates heard from Ms. Gülnur Aybet, Professor of International Relations at Istanbul's Bahcesehir University. She discussed NATO's role as a common security provider which began when NATO intervened in Bosnia and Herzegovina and Kosovo. NATO's most recent intervention to protect civilians in Libya raised a number of concerns regarding the Alliance's ability to be a security provider. The legitimacy of the intervention was questioned by many within the international community. Ms. Aybet warned that Allies must be aware that such questions may arise in the future as NATO adapts its operations to counter evolving global security challenges.

The next speaker was Dr. Bichara Khader, Professor Emeritus, Catholic University of Louvain, Belgium. He argued that the Arab Spring and the sentiments of democracy and freedom that had sweep through the region have been co-opted. This has resulted in the re-establishment of military dictatorships and the outbreak of civil war in several countries. One of the factors contributing to the conflicts in the region is one of demographics. Dr. Khader emphasized that the region's youth are educated, modern and believe in liberty and democracy -- which often places them at odds with Islamic conservatives.

Three draft reports and two resolutions were discussed and adopted⁸. On behalf of the Canadian delegation, Senator Raynell Andreychuk proposed amendments to the resolution entitled Defeating Daesh in order to include a clause describing the atrocities committed by Daesh including the genocide against the Yazidis, as determined by the United Nations, as well as adding a clause urging NATO parliamentarians and governments to call for an investigation into the crimes committed by Daesh to identify perpetrators and hold them accountable. Both amendments were agreed upon without any dissensions or abstentions.

Finally, the Committee discussed its studies and activities for 2017 and elected Committee and Sub-Committee officers. Mrs. Cheryl Gallant, M.P., Senator Joseph Day and Senator Raynell Andreychuk participated in these discussions.

3. Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security⁹

Senator Jane Cordy, former Vice-President of the Committee, was asked to preside over the Committee's meetings as the Chairperson was unable to attend the Annual Session. During the meetings, delegates received four presentations.

The first speaker was Mr. Bekir Bozdağ, Turkey's Minister of Justice. The Minister gave delegates a description of the July 2016 coup attempt in Turkey, and the role of Imam Gülen. According to Minister Bozdağ, Gülen's supporters, identified as the Fethullah Terrorist Organisation (FETO) by the Government of Turkey, attempted a complete take-over of the state and infiltrated all levels of government departments, agencies and schools. He expressed his disappointment in the lack of solidarity from the international community, and its lack of support for the Government of Turkey as the coup attempt

⁸ The [reports](#) are: "Implementation of Wales and Warsaw: Political Aspects," "China in a Changing World," and "Security in the Gulf." The Resolutions are available on the NATO PA website: "[Policy Recommendations 2016](#)."

⁹ A more detailed summary of the meetings can be found at: [Annual Session – Committee on the Civil Dimensions of Security](#).

was taking place. Mrs. Cheryl Gallant, M.P., asked the Minister how his government could be certain that Gülen was behind the attempted coup and why the U.S. had not extradited him yet if there was sufficient evidence against him. The Minister responded that the evidence against Gülen was “crystal clear,” but did not comment on the issue of extradition.

The second speaker was Mr. Andriy Parubiy, Chairman of the Verkhovna Rada (parliament) of Ukraine. Mr. Parubiy informed delegates that reform of the Ukrainian armed forces is ongoing though difficult as the country continues to face Russian aggression. Nevertheless, he expressed his certainty that Ukraine will eventually become a NATO member. He explained that Russian aggression in Ukraine is occurring through many dimensions: military, information, energy, economic, to name a few. He also underlined that the conflict in Ukraine is a regional and global issue, reminding delegates that the situation in Crimea remains a violation of Ukraine’s sovereignty and territorial integrity.

Next, the Committee heard from Mr. Sanj Srikanthan, Deputy Executive Director and Vice President (Europe), International Rescue Committee. Mr. Srikanthan described the nature of the global refugee and migrant crisis, noting that today there are 65 million displaced people in world – an increase from 35 million over the last decade. He stated that currently, the top three refugee-producing countries are Iraq, Syria and Afghanistan. He argued that solutions to the crisis will not be found from within the countries experiencing conflict. Instead, he suggested that while humanitarian aid helps in the short term, long-term policy solutions need to come from the international community. He recommended that partnerships with countries of first asylum in Africa and the Middle East should be strengthened. Creating sustainable opportunities for individuals in those countries may improve their livelihoods and lessen their motivation to risk their lives by attempting the Mediterranean crossing. He also encouraged European countries to devise a comprehensive approach to accept refugees and migrants, and improve their resettlement programs. Senator Vernon White raised the need for increased burden sharing particularly by neighbouring Arab countries. Mr. Srikanthan stressed that sharing the responsibility for refugees is a crucial issue and that all UN member states that have the capacity and resources to absorb refugees should do so.

Lastly, Committee members heard from Dr. Sabine Freizer, Regional Advisor on Women, Peace and Security, UN Women Regional Office for Europe and Central Asia. Dr. Freizer explained that the ongoing conflicts in the Middle East are resulting in increased sexual violence against women and other forms of gender-based violence and discrimination. A recent gender assessment conducted by the UN determined that the needs of and risks faced by female refugees, particularly along the Balkan route into Europe, were not adequately taken into account by international organizations. As well, she argued that female refugees are also discriminated against within the asylum process. In 2015, close to 100,000 more men were granted refugee status in Europe than women. She also noted the difficulty for female asylum seekers to prove that they are victims of gender-based persecution. Finally Dr. Freizer called on parliamentarians to ensure that asylum legislation includes measures to prevent gender-based discrimination.

The Committee's rapporteurs presented their respective draft reports¹⁰ and one resolution (on Forging a Concerted Response to Terrorism at Home) then opened the floor to final amendments from other members. All were subsequently adopted. Finally, the Committee discussed its studies and activities for 2017 and elected Committee and Sub-Committee officers. Senator Jane Cordy, former Vice-President of the Committee, was elected as General Rapporteur for the Committee's Sub-Committee on Democratic Governance. The Canadian delegates who participated in the discussions were Mrs. Cheryl Gallant, M.P., Senator Joseph Day, Senator Raynell Andreychuk, and Senator Vernon White.

4. Science and Technology Committee ¹¹

During the meeting of the Science and Technology Committee, delegates heard from two speakers. The first speaker was Mr. Ian Anthony, Director, European Security Programme, Stockholm International Peace Research Institute. He discussed the state of European security and supported an updated arms control framework between Europe and Russia. He acknowledged though, that the current relationship between Europe and Russia negates the possibility of negotiating a new framework at this point in time. Given the current climate, he argued that NATO and the EU should, at the very least, cooperate on developing a common understanding of the security challenges affecting the region. This would include four critical aspects: threat definition, containment of crises, prevention of conflict escalation, and the protection of civilians in conflict areas.

Next, Mr. Faruk Özlü, Turkey's Minister of Science, Industry and Technology addressed the committee. He outlined how the Government of Turkey was addressing security challenges with new military and intelligence technologies. He explained that his government has boosted its domestic defence industry by streamlining research and development policies and engaging in international procurement opportunities. He encouraged Allies to develop a strategy to improve technology sharing, particularly in the realm of cybersecurity. Mrs. Cheryl Gallant, M.P., asked the Minister if he could provide more information on the arrests of individuals following the attempted coup based on their downloading of a specific mobile phone app. The Minister declined to answer, stating that the matter should be discussed with Turkish law enforcement and intelligence services.

The Committee's rapporteurs presented their respective draft reports and draft resolution which were adopted after the Committee considered final amendments¹². Lastly, the Committee discussed its studies and activities for 2017 and elected

¹⁰ The [reports](#) are: "Enhancing Euro-Atlantic Counterterrorism Capabilities and Cooperation," "Ukraine's Two Wars: Protecting Independence and Implementing Real Reforms" and "The Western Balkans: European and Euro-Atlantic Integration Challenges." The Resolutions are available on the NATO PA website: "[Policy Recommendations 2016](#)."

¹¹ A more detailed summary of the meeting can be found at: [Annual Session: Science and Technology Committee](#).

¹² The [reports](#) are: "The Future of Allied Airborne Intelligence, Surveillance and Reconnaissance," "Chemical, Biological, Radiological, Nuclear Terrorism: The Rise of Daesh and Future Challenges," and "The Iranian Nuclear Programme: How to Build Upon the Deal" The Resolutions are available on the NATO PA website: "[Policy Recommendations 2016](#)."

Committee and Sub-Committee officers. Canadian delegates participating in the Science and Technology Committee's meetings included Senator Joseph Day, Mr. Steven MacKinnon, M.P., Mrs. Cheryl Gallant, M.P., and Mr. Matt Jeneroux, M.P.

5. Economics and Security Committee¹³

The Economics and Security Committee heard from three speakers. First, Mr. Sanj Srikanthan, Deputy Executive Director and Vice President (Europe), International Rescue Committee, discussed the same issues he had presented in the Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security.

Next, Mr. Mehmet Sjmşek, Turkey's Deputy Prime Minister, addressed the delegates regarding his country's economic outlook. Mr. Sjmşek first gave an overview of global economic dynamics over recent years, noting that growth has remained slow worldwide following the financial crisis due to rising protectionism, ageing populations, and weak investments. In his opinion, this has led to falling productivity, public and private sectors consumed by high debt, and slow implementation of necessary structural reforms. With respect to Turkey's economy, he noted that it recovered swiftly from the global financial crisis. However, recent internal and external shocks such as the Syrian crisis, terrorist attacks on Turkish soil and the attempted coup, have all contributed to the country's economic slowdown. For instance, he stated that in 2016, the decrease of tourism in Turkey alone cost the country 1.2 percentage points in GDP growth. Mr. Steven MacKinnon, M.P., asked the Minister about Turkey's strategy to fund infrastructure renewal. In his response, the Minister stated that financing infrastructure projects through public-private partnerships was the way forward for fiscally constrained governments.

The Committee's last speaker was Dr. Daniela Schwarzer, Director of the Research Institute at the German Council on Foreign Relations. Dr. Schwarzer offered delegates her assessment of the current transatlantic economic relationship, notably the U.S. - EU economic relationship. She stated that given the political uncertainty resulting from the election of President Trump and the United Kingdom's decision to leave the EU (known colloquially as BREXIT), the economies of the U.S. and EU were currently underperforming. As well, increasing scepticism over free trade both in the U.S. and in Europe is threatening to dismantle current negotiations on the U.S.-EU free trade agreement: the Transatlantic Trade and Investment Partnership (TIPP). Given that trade between the U.S. and the EU accounts for over 50% of the world's GDP, Dr. Schwarzer argued that there needs to be higher investment in the transatlantic relationship both politically and economically. During the question and answer period, Mr. Steven MacKinnon, M.P., stressed the importance for Canada and the EU to sign and ratify their own free trade agreement: the Canada – EU Comprehensive Economic and Trade Agreement (CETA).

The Committee's Rapporteurs presented three reports and one resolution on *Allied Defence Spending*¹⁴. After considering final amendments, the reports and the resolution

¹³ A more detailed summary of the meetings can be found at: [Annual Session: Economics and Security Committee](#).

were adopted. The Committee then discussed its studies and activities for 2017 and elected Committee and Sub-Committee officers. Mr. Steven MacKinnon, M.P., was elected Rapporteur of the Committee's Sub-Committee on Transatlantic Economic Relations. Canadian delegates participating in these discussions included Mr. Jean Rioux, M.P., Senator Joseph Day, Mr. Steven MacKinnon, M.P., Mr. Matt Jeneroux, M.P., and Mrs. Cheryl Gallant, M.P.

PLENARY SITTING ¹⁵

The Plenary Sitting of the 62nd Annual Session took place on the final day, following two days of Committee meetings. Congressman Michael Turner (U.S.), President of the NATO PA, presided over the Plenary Sitting. In his opening remarks, he reflected upon his two-year term noting that he assumed the NATO PA presidency amid Russian aggression in Ukraine. He remarked on the Alliance's recent transformation from the commitments made at the Wales Summit to counter Russia's actions and their subsequent implementation at the Warsaw Summit, where he was proud to participate on behalf of the NATO PA. He encouraged Allies to maintain a united front vis-à-vis Russia by further strengthening the Alliance's deterrence posture and upholding its open door policy. While acknowledging the recent attempted coup in Turkey, he urged the Government of Turkey to preserve its commitment to NATO's shared values of democracy, rule of law and human rights. He praised the Turkish population for defending these values as they protested and fought against the perpetrators of the attempted coup.

NATO PA delegates then heard from His Excellency Mr. Recep Tayyip Erdoğan, President of the Republic of Turkey. President Erdoğan noted that Turkey was on the frontline of the 21st century's most complex security challenges. He also reaffirmed his country's commitment to NATO and stated that Turkey is an "indispensable" member of the Alliance, particularly given the threats it is currently tackling. He also stressed that NATO is an alliance of countries loyal to democracy. In reaction to the criticism he and his government have faced with respect to their actions following the attempted coup, President Erdoğan insisted the response was necessary in order to find and hold those responsible accountable for their crimes. He called the perpetrators of the failed coup "terrorists," and stressed that all the measures his government has taken are to protect the Turkish state and its institutions, and to adhere to the rule of law.

Next, NATO Secretary General Jens Stoltenberg addressed the delegates. He began by stating his commitment to remain in close contact with the NATO PA. As a former parliamentarian himself, Mr. Stoltenberg noted the important role parliaments play in defence policy-making and supporting government action in matters of defence and security. He also emphasized how the NATO PA reflects that the Alliance is one made up of 28 democracies – providing a forum for the political exchange of various opinions. He then highlighted the outcomes of the NATO Warsaw Summit which took place in

¹⁴ The titles of these [reports](#) are: "The Budgetary Implications of New Challenges to Transatlantic Security," "The Economic and Security Consequences of the Migration Crisis," and "The Corruption-Security Nexus." The Resolutions are available on the NATO PA website: "[Policy Recommendations 2016](#)."

¹⁵ For the complete minutes of the Plenary Session, please see "[Summary - Plenary Sitting](#)."

July 2016, namely: improvements to NATO-EU cooperation, NATO's response to instability in the MENA region and the refugee crisis, and NATO's ongoing commitment to deterrence in Eastern and Central Europe. Finally, he touched on the issue of burden sharing and stressed the importance of narrowing the gap in defence spending between the U.S. and the rest of the Allies.

Ms. Christine Muttonen, President of the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) Parliamentary Assembly addressed the delegates next. She described her Assembly's role in supporting the work of the OSCE as it strives for inclusive and long-term security in the region. The latest priorities have included arms control and disarmament as well as the challenges emanating from the Syrian conflict, particularly the refugee and migrant crisis. With respect to the latter issue, Ms. Muttonen acknowledged that the collective response from the OSCE region could have been better and that the region has not lived up to its own standards and values in dealing with the crisis. She highlighted the importance of parliamentary assemblies in addressing security challenges and strengthening democracy. She also underlined areas where the NATO PA and OSCE PA cooperate, for instance, with election monitoring.

Next, elections were held for the positions of NATO PA President, Vice-Presidents and Treasurer. Senator Joseph Day was elected as one of the Vice-Presidents.

Mr. Paolo Alli (Italy), the newly-elected President of the NATO PA, addressed the delegates. He highlighted his priorities for his term as president. He called for unity among the Allies in addressing today's challenging security environment, and stated his desire to increase cooperation with European institutions and raise the profile of the NATO PA in the area of education so that NATO populations could better understand the role and significance of the Alliance.

Delegates then heard from Mr. John Jacobs, President of the Youth Atlantic Treaty Association (YATA). He highlighted YATA's perspective on the five key defence and security priorities of the transatlantic community: counter terrorism, hybrid warfare, women and security, energy security, and defence spending. Mr. Jacobs also urged parliamentarians to connect with youth who are engaged on defence and security issues to bridge, what he views, as a generation gap in that field of interest.

NATO PA Committee reports and resolutions were presented by their respective rapporteurs, which included Senators Joseph Day and Jane Cordy, and subsequently adopted.

In closing, NATO PA President Alli thanked the Turkish Delegation, its staff, the staff of the Turkish Parliament, the International Secretariat, and all others who were instrumental in the Session's success.

SUMMARY

The NATO PA provides Canadian parliamentarians with an opportunity to learn about the broader strategic issues facing the Alliance, which have an impact on Canada's national security and defence. It also gives them an attentive international forum in which to promote Canadian interests and values in the course of discussions and

debates about future Alliance policy and strategy. As this report indicates, the 2016 Annual Session was no exception, offering Canadian delegates many opportunities to shape the outcome of discussions, convey a Canadian perspective on key issues of concern, and gain a better understanding of strategic issues facing Canada, the Alliance and Canada's partner countries.

First and foremost, NATO PA members had the opportunity to learn more about Turkey's domestic and regional security environment. As was noted by Turkey's President, Ministers, parliamentarians and government officials throughout the sessions, the country has been deeply traumatized by the attempted coup of 15 July 2016. They also expressed their disappointment with what they perceived as a lack of solidarity and support from NATO allies, in the wake of the attack. In addition, they perceive a lack of support from the Alliance to address the security threats Turkey is currently facing, namely terrorism and other challenges emanating from the Syrian crisis such as the flow of migrants and refugees into the country. In response, Allied parliamentarians expressed their solidarity with Turkey by condemning the attempted coup and by commending the Turkish people and parliamentarians for their resistance. However, they also reminded their Turkish counterparts that NATO is an alliance of shared values which include democracy, the rule of law, and human rights. Delegates particularly raised concerns regarding the wave of dismissals and arrests since the failed coup attempt, including the detention of opposition lawmakers and journalists.

Overall, the NATO PA appreciates the opportunity to participate in the process of monitoring the implementation of the commitments agreed to at the Wales and Warsaw Summits, particularly with respect to defence and deterrence on NATO's Eastern Flank, and projecting stability on its Southern Flank. All members of the NATO PA continue to be concerned about Russian interference in Ukraine and its use of hybrid warfare tactics to undermine the stability of NATO governments and societies. Instability in the Middle East and North Africa continue to be priorities for the NATO PA as it explores how it can engage with various transitional governments in the region on democratic development. The conflict in Syria and the related refugee and migrant crisis were of particular focus at this Annual Session. Afghanistan, particularly NATO's ongoing training mission in that country, continues to be priority. Delegates also had the opportunity to discuss how the U.S.-NATO relationship may change under the new Trump administration. Canada and Canadian parliamentarians continue to have strategic interests in all these issues and value the opportunity to contribute to the activities of the NATO PA.

Respectfully submitted,

Leona Alleslev, M.P.
Chair of the Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association

Travel Costs

| | |
|-----------------------------|--|
| ASSOCIATION | Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association (NATO PA) |
| ACTIVITY | 62nd Annual Session of the NATO Parliamentary Assembly |
| DESTINATION | Istanbul, Turkey |
| DATES | November 18-21, 2016 |
| DELEGATION | |
| SENATE | Hon. Joseph Day, Hon. Jane Cordy, Hon. Raynell Andreychuk, Hon Vernon White |
| HOUSE OF COMMONS | Jean Rioux, Cheryl Gallant, Steven MacKinnon, Pierre Paul- Hus, Matt Jeneroux, David Christopherson |
| STAFF | Jean-François Pagé, Melissa Radford |
| TRANSPORTATION | \$ 40,784.88 |
| ACCOMMODATION | \$ 14,614.10 |
| HOSPITALITY | \$ 34.00 |
| PER DIEMS | \$ 9,049.65 |
| OFFICIAL GIFTS | \$ 0 |
| MISCELLANEOUS | \$ 140.38 |
| TOTAL | \$ 64,623.01 |