

Canadian NATO
Parliamentary Association



Association parlementaire
canadienne de l'OTAN

Report of the Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association

68th Annual Session

Madrid, Spain

From November 18 to 21, 2022

Report

The Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association is honoured to present its report on its participation in the 68th Annual Session of the North Atlantic Treaty Organization Parliamentary Assembly (NATO PA, or the Assembly), which took place from 18-21 November 2022. The following Canadian delegates participated in the Annual Session:

- Ms. Julie Dzerowicz, MP, Chair of the Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association and Head of the Canadian delegation to the NATO PA;
- The Honourable Pierre-Hugues Boisvenu, Senator;
- The Honourable Jane Cordy, Senator;
- The Honourable Mohamed-Iqbal Ravalia, Senator;
- Ms. Rachel Blaney, MP;
- Ms. Cheryl Gallant, MP;
- Ms. Shelby Kramp-Neuman, MP;
- Ms. Christine Normandin, MP; and
- Ms. Jennifer O'Connell, MP.

Association staff who attended the 68th Annual Session (the Annual Session or the Session) included Céline Ethier, Association Secretary, and Andrés León, Association Advisor.

THE NATO PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY

Established in 1955, the NATO PA is a parliamentary organization that comprises more than 280 legislators from the 32 NATO member countries,¹ and around 90 additional delegates from associate or observer countries,² as well as representatives from other parliamentary assemblies. Although Finland and Sweden applied for NATO membership at the same time in May 2022, Finland did not become NATO's 31st member until 4 April 2023, while Sweden became the 32nd member on 7 March 2024. At the Assembly's 68th Annual Session, which was held in November 2022, Finland and Sweden attended as associate members.

While independent in an institutional sense, the NATO PA has developed close ties with NATO (or the Alliance) over the years. The NATO PA provides legislators in the transatlantic region with a forum to debate and further their knowledge of various issues pertaining to defence and security. It also helps to consolidate NATO's political dimension.³

¹ The 32 member countries of the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) are: Albania, Belgium, Bulgaria, Canada, Croatia, Czechia, Denmark, Estonia, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Hungary, Iceland, Italy, Latvia, Lithuania, Luxembourg, Montenegro, the Netherlands, North Macedonia, Norway, Poland, Portugal, Romania, Slovakia, Slovenia, Spain, Sweden, Türkiye, the United Kingdom and the United States.

² The associate delegations are from: Armenia, Austria, Azerbaijan, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Georgia, Moldova, Serbia, Switzerland and Ukraine. The regional partner and Mediterranean associate delegations are from: Algeria, Israel, Jordan and Morocco. For more information, see NATO Parliamentary Assembly (NATO PA), [Members](#).

³ See NATO PA, [Our Mission](#).

The NATO PA has five thematic committees, most of which have sub-committees:⁴

- the Committee on Democracy and Security (Subcommittee: Resilience and Civil Security).
- the Defence and Security Committee (Subcommittees: Future Security and Defence Capabilities, and Transatlantic Security Defence Cooperation).
- the Economics and Security Committee (Subcommittees: Transition and Development, and Transatlantic Economic Relations).
- the Political Committee (Subcommittees: NATO Partnerships and Transatlantic Relations).
- the Science and Technology Committee (Subcommittee: Technology Trends and Security).

The practices of the five thematic committees are similar to those of Canadian parliamentary committees. NATO PA committee members hear from experts and conduct fact-finding missions throughout the year. Moreover, certain individual committee and subcommittee members are designated as rapporteurs, who are then responsible for drafting reports and/or resolutions. Committee members consider these draft reports and resolutions during the NATO PA's spring and fall sessions; the latter is known as the "Annual Session."

THE 68th ANNUAL SESSION

The COVID-19 pandemic forced the cancellation of most in-person NATO PA meetings throughout most of 2020 and in early to mid-2021. During that period, the Assembly and its committees and subcommittees conducted their work virtually.

In 2022, a year that was marked by Russia's full-scale invasion of Ukraine, the NATO PA resumed most of its in-person meeting and activities. On 18–21 November 2022, Spain hosted the NATO PA's 68th Annual Session, which was the first annual session that the Canadian delegation to the NATO PA attended in-person since 2019. The Session was chaired by outgoing President of the NATO PA, Gerald Connolly of the United States (U.S.) – who was elected president in 2020.

Discussions at the Session were guided by several key topics, including:

- the war in Ukraine;
- NATO's 2022 Strategic Concept;
- transatlantic cooperation and security;
- China assertiveness in the Indo-Pacific region;
- climate change and security; and
- cyberattacks and other acts of hybrid warfare.

The Annual Session's program included meetings of the Standing Committee and each of the thematic committees, as well as a Plenary session and an extraordinary meeting

⁴ For detailed information on each committee's mandate and activities, see NATO PA, [Committee on Democracy and Security \(CDS\)](#); NATO PA, [Defence and Security Committee \(DSC\)](#); NATO PA, [Economics and Security Committee \(ESC\)](#); NATO PA, [Political Committee \(PC\)](#); and NATO PA, [Science and Technology Committee \(STC\)](#).

of the Ukraine–NATO Interparliamentary Council.⁵ A NATO PA coordination meeting involving members of the Bureau (President, five Vice-Presidents, and a Treasurer), Chairpersons of Committees and Sub-committees, and Rapporteurs was also held prior to the start of the 68th Annual Session. Finally, delegates attended a reception at the Royal Palace of Madrid.

A. Standing Committee

The Standing Committee⁶ met on Sunday, 20 November 2022, to address various administrative matters, receive updates, discuss certain defence and security issues, and plan for upcoming activities in 2023. Finland and Sweden were the first NATO PA associate delegations to have been invited to attend a Standing Committee meeting.

At the conclusion of the meeting, the Head of the Canadian Delegation, Julie Dzerowicz, MP, announced that Montreal, Canada would host the NATO PA's 70th Annual Session in November 2024.⁷ Canada previously hosted the Annual Session in Halifax in 2018.

Canadian Participation:

Senator Jane Cordy and Julie Dzerowicz, MP participated in this meeting.

B. The Ukraine–NATO Interparliamentary Council

The Ukraine–NATO Interparliamentary Council (UNIC) was established in 1998 to increase cooperation between parliamentarians from NATO member countries and Ukraine and bring greater transparency to the implementation of the NATO–Ukraine Charter.⁸

UNIC held an extraordinary meeting on Friday, 18 November 2022. Six Ukrainian parliamentarians and 35 legislators from NATO member countries participated in this meeting.

Michal Szczerba of Poland, Co-Chair of UNIC, provided welcoming remarks, before Yehor Cherniev, the Head of the Ukrainian delegation, updated the participants on the situation in Ukraine. Mr. Cherniev discussed several issues, including:

- Ukraine's counteroffensive against the Russian Armed Forces;
- NATO member countries' military assistance to Ukraine; and
- Russia's acts of aggression and human rights violations against civilians in Ukraine.

⁵ The Ukraine–NATO Interparliamentary Council generally meets twice a year: once in Brussels at NATO headquarters and once in Ukraine. However, following Russia's February 2022 full-scale invasion of Ukraine, UNIC met four times in 2022, including on 18 November 2022.

⁶ The Standing Committee of the NATO PA comprises Heads of National Delegations, Bureau members (President, Vice Presidents and Treasurer), and the Secretary General. It has various political and administrative duties, including coordinating the overall work of the Assembly.

⁷ Parl Diplomacy (@ParlDiplomacy), "[#CANADA Chair @Julie Dzerowicz was pleased to announce to #NATOPAMadrid that Canada will host the 70th Annual Session in Montreal, Quebec, in November 2024.....](#)," X, 23 November 2022, 3:30pm.

⁸ NATO, [Charter on a Distinctive Partnership: between the North Atlantic Treaty Organization and Ukraine](#) (last updated 4 March 2009).

NATO PA President Connolly also provided remarks. He highlighted his trip to the border between Poland and Ukraine in early 2022; spoke about U.S military and humanitarian assistance to Ukraine; and condemned Russia's illegal annexation of the Ukrainian regions of Crimea, Donetsk, Luhansk, and Zaporizhzhia. As well, President Connolly expressed his support for Ukraine joining the European Union (EU).

Canadian Participation:

Senator Jane Cordy and Julie Dzerowicz, MP participated in the meeting.

C. Committee Business

From 19 to 20 November 2022, the NATO PA's five committees met simultaneously. During these meetings, the committees considered and finalized revised draft reports and resolutions for 2022. Participating delegates also heard from a wide range of speakers, including Spanish government and military officials, NATO officials, and academic and policy experts on issues of interest to NATO (or the Alliance).⁹

1. Committee on Democracy and Security

The Committee on Democracy and Security met on Saturday, 19 November 2022, and on Sunday, 20 November 2022.¹⁰

Two speakers delivered presentations to the Committee and responded to questions and comments:

- Felix Bolaños, Spain's Minister for the Presidency, Parliamentary Relations and Democratic Memory of Spain; and
- Alicia Cebada Romero, Professor at the Universidad Carlos III de Madrid.

The Indispensable Fight Against Exclusion, Discrimination and Inequality

Minister Bolaños discussed political, societal and economic issues in Spain, including migration, income and gender inequality, and climate change. He provided an overview of measures implemented in Spain to address some of these issues, such as increasing access to post-secondary education, "bolstering" health care and other services, and increasing pension and minimum income levels.

Minister Bolaños also drew attention to increased political polarization in Spain and other countries. Within that context, he expressed his opposition to individuals and entities that promote xenophobic views about migrants and other marginalized groups.

Minister Bolaños concluded his presentation by responding to questions and comments from NATO PA delegates, including from Rachel Blaney, MP. Ms. Blaney asked Minister Bolaños about his thoughts on social cohesion in Spain, with regard to how migrants are perceived. Ms. Blaney also asked the Minister about Spain's approach to addressing income inequality.

⁹ For more information, see NATO PA, [Speakers](#).

¹⁰ For a detailed summary of the Committee on the Democracy and Security's meeting, see NATO PA, [2022 Madrid Meeting Summaries](#).

Preventing and Combatting the Use of Sexual Violence as a Weapon of War

Dr. Cebada Romero discussed three branches of international law that address the use of sexual violence in conflict: international humanitarian law, international human rights law and international criminal law. She explained that several international courts have used existing international legal frameworks to prosecute those accused of perpetrating acts of sexual violence during conflicts. However, she underscored that acts of sexual violence remain “pervasive” in many conflicts, including during the ongoing war in Ukraine.

Before answering to questions and comments from NATO PA delegates, Dr. Cebada Romero called on NATO member countries to take steps to address sexual violence, including through:

- the implementation of the Alliance’s Women, Peace and Security agenda;
- the development of a survivor-based approach to sexual violence that focuses on countering the stigmatization of sexual violence survivors; and
- support for women-led entities that address sexual violence in conflict.

Reports, resolutions and elections of committee and sub-committee members

The Committee’s rapporteurs presented three draft reports¹¹ and a resolution¹² for consideration and amendment. During the Committee’s consideration of its resolution on cyber resilience, Senator Cordy asked a question related to the protection of critical infrastructure against cyber threats. The Committee’s reports and resolution were then adopted.

Committee members also elected committee and sub-committee officers. Julie Dzerowicz, MP, was elected special rapporteur, and Senator Jane Cordy was elected vice-chair of the Sub-Committee on Resilience and Civil Security.

Finally, committee members discussed future activities and studies before concluding their deliberations.

Canadian Participation:

Canadians who participated in the Committee’s deliberations included: Senator Jane Cordy; Rachel Blaney, MP; Julie Dzerowicz, MP; and Cheryl Gallant, MP.

2. Defence and Security Committee

¹¹ The Committee on the Democracy and Security’s reports were: [Strengthening the Protection of Critical Infrastructure Against Cyber Threats](#); [Acting to Preserve the Humanitarian Space: What Role for the Allies and for Nato?](#); and [Understanding, Adapting to, and Limiting the Impact of Climate Change on Allied Civil Security](#).

¹² The Committee on the Democracy and Security’s resolution was entitled, [Enhancing the Cyber Resilience of Allied Societies](#).

The Defence and Security Committee met on Saturday, 19 November 2022, and on Sunday, 20 November 2022.¹³

Five speakers addressed the Committee and responded to questions and comments:

- Margarita Robles, Minister of Defence of Spain;
- Admiral General Teodoro Esteban López Calderón, Chief of the Defence Staff of Spain;
- Clint Reach, International Defence Researcher at the RAND Corporation;
- Marina Rodriguez, Head of the Cybersecurity and Fight Against Disinformation Unit within the Office of the Prime Minister of Spain; and
- Gabriel Gascone, Head of the Counter-Terrorism Section at NATO's Emerging Security Challenges Division.

Spain: A Strong Commitment to the Alliance

Minister Robles highlighted NATO's support for Ukraine, as well the need for the Alliance to be able to respond to new and emerging threats to Euro-Atlantic security. She recalled that, at NATO's June 2022 Madrid Summit, Allied leaders had expressed a shared commitment to enhancing NATO's defence and deterrence posture, including through the adoption of the 2022 Strategic Concept. Minister Robles also remarked that NATO has developed a "360-degree approach" to addressing new and emerging defence and security issues.

With a focus on NATO's role in the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region, Minister Robles spoke about the growing importance of that region for Spain, particularly in terms of the security situation in the Sahel. She contended that NATO should continue to collaborate with like-minded partners from the MENA and Asia-Pacific regions to address existing and emerging security issues.

Before concluding her presentation, Minister Robles reaffirmed Spain's efforts to increase its level of defence spending to meet NATO's 2% of national gross domestic product (GDP) target. She also noted Spain's involvement in NATO missions and operations.

The Present and Future Contribution of the Spanish Armed Forces to the Alliance

Admiral General López Calderón drew attention to Spain's military contributions to NATO, as well as the Spanish Armed Force's efforts to address new and emerging challenges. Such challenges relate to matters including the space domain, counterterrorism and information intelligence systems. He also underscored the need for the Alliance to develop a new framework on defence investments to address some of these challenges. Admiral General López Calderón then responded to questions and comments from participating committee members.

Political Origins of Russia's War on Ukraine

¹³ For a detailed summary of the Defence and Security Committee's meeting, see NATO PA, [2022 Madrid Meeting Summaries](#).

Mr. Reach discussed the drivers of Russia's full-scale invasion of Ukraine. He also contended that the Russian Intelligence Services played a significant role in the planning of Russia's invasion of Ukraine.

Mr. Reach then highlighted Russia's global and regional goals, characterizing the country's efforts to modernize its armed forces as a "regional rather than domestic [goal]."

Prior to concluding his presentation, Mr. Reach responded to comments and questions from committee members, including from Senator Pierre-Hugues Boisvenu. Senator Boisvenu asked about potential challenges to Vladimir Putin's presidency. In responding, Mr. Reach observed that Russian nationalists could "threaten" President Putin's ability to remain as Russia's leader.

The Growing Cyber Challenges and Implications for the Alliance

Ms. Rodriguez highlighted the role of Spain's Cybersecurity and Fight Against Disinformation Unit in countering cyber threats and disinformation. She underscored the need to increase cooperation among NATO member countries and partners to protect information systems from a wide range of cyber threats. Ms. Rodriguez also spoke about the impacts of disinformation on democratic processes and institutions.

Ms. Rodriguez concluded her presentation by responding to questions and comments from committee members, including from Christine Normandin, MP. Ms. Normandin asked about Spain's efforts to prevent cyberattacks against individuals who have had to telework, especially during the COVID-19 pandemic.

Reports, resolutions and elections of committee and sub-committee members

Prior to the conclusion of the meeting, the Committee's rapporteurs presented four draft reports¹⁴ and a resolution¹⁵ for consideration and amendment. These reports and the resolution were then adopted.

Committee members also elected committee and sub-committee officers, and discussed future activities for 2023. Senator Pierre-Hugues Boisvenu was re-elected as a vice-chair of the Sub-Committee on Future Security and Defence Capabilities.

Canadian Participation:

Canadians who participated in the Committee's deliberations included: Senator Pierre-Hugues Boisvenu; Cheryl Gallant, MP; and Christine Normandin, MP.

3. Economics and Security Committee

¹⁴ The Defence and Security Committee's reports were: [Russia's Invasion of Ukraine: Implications for Allied Collective Defence and the Imperatives of the new Strategic Concept](#); [The Evolving Threat of Terrorism: Adapting the Allied Response](#); [The Offense-Defence Balance: NATO's Growing Cyber Challenge](#); and [Ukraine's Fight for Freedom & Allied and Global Response to Russia's War](#).

¹⁵ The Defence and Security Committee's resolution was entitled, [Supporting NATO's Post-Madrid Summit Deterrence and Defence Initiatives](#).

The Economics and Security Committee met on Saturday, 19 November 2022.¹⁶

Three speakers addressed the Committee and responded to questions and comments:

- Nadia Calviño, Deputy Prime Minister of Spain, and Minister of the Economy and Digital Transformation of Spain;
- Emmanuel Dupuy, President of the Institute European Perspective & Security; and
- Jacob Kirkegaard, Senior Fellow at the German Marshall Fund of the United States, and the Peterson Institute for International Economics.

Spain's Response to the Twin Shocks of COVID-19 and the War in Ukraine

Minister Calviño observed that the COVID-19 pandemic and the war in Ukraine have had a negative impact on the economies of Spain and other countries. She stated that, throughout the COVID-19 pandemic, a number of Western European countries, including Spain, faced numerous challenges including global supply chain disruptions, volatile price levels, and an economic slowdown, among other issues. Minister Calviño also underlined that the negative economic effects of the war in Ukraine “added another layer of volatility” to the economic crises across a number of countries worldwide.

With a focus on Spain's economic situation, Minister Calviño highlighted several domestic and European Union (EU) measures that the Government of Spain has implemented since 2020 to aid Spain's economic recovery. These measures include the implementation of the EU Next Generation Plan to “preserve investment” and increase strategic autonomy and security for Spain's agriculture, technology and digital sectors, among others.

Finally, Minister Calviño drew attention to Spain's efforts to diversify its energy supply sources. She said that, unlike some of the Northern European countries, Spain and Portugal are not dependent on Russia's energy sources, noting that, over the past years, the two countries have invested in the development of renewable energies, and the production of clean technologies.

High Intensity and Hybrid Warfare in Ukraine: Geopolitical and Goeconomic Implications for Allies

Mr. Dupuy discussed the concept of “hybrid warfare,” which some experts define as a blend of military and non-military actions used to “disrupt and disable an opponent's actions without engaging in open hostilities.”¹⁷ Within that context, Mr. Dupuy commented that both Russia and China have deployed hybrid warfare tactics against other countries and actors.

¹⁶ For a detailed summary of the Economics and Security Committee's meeting, see NATO PA, [2022 Madrid Meeting Summaries](#).

¹⁷ See Andrew Dowse and Sascha-Dominik (Dov) Bachmann, “[Explainer: what is 'hybrid warfare' and what is meant by the 'grey zone'?](#),” *The Conversation*, 17 June 2019; and David Carment and Dani Belo, [War's Future: The Risks and Rewards of Grey-Zone Conflict and Hybrid Warfare](#), Canadian Global Affairs Institute, October 2018.

Mr. Dupuy stated that NATO has taken several steps to address the issue of hybrid warfare, including through the adoption of the 2022 Strategic Concept. The 2022 Strategic Concept mentions the terms “hybrid tactics” and “hybrid terms” several times, stating in paragraph seven, for instance, that authoritarian actors have sought to challenge the Alliance’s interests and democratic values through different means, including through “hybrid tactics.”

Mr. Dupuy also remarked that the Alliance faces several challenges that require a “reappraisal of military, societal and economic resilience and better foresight for preparing for the battlefield of the future.” He recommended that the Alliance add a sixth operational domain – societal resilience – to its existing five (land, air, sea, cyber and outer space).

Finally, Mr. Dupuy provided the Committee with several recommendations for enhancing NATO’s ability to counter “high and low intensity warfare.” Such recommendations include:

- increasing the level of defence spending among NATO member countries to enhance the Alliance’s defence and deterrence posture;
- recognizing the involvement of private militaries like the Wagner Group in warfare;
- acknowledging the role that some private firms are playing in the weaponization of space; and
- enhancing societal resilience vis-a-vis disinformation and other forms of hybrid threats.

Towards the Reconstruction of Ukraine

Mr. Kirkegaard noted that the Group of Seven (G7) could play a key role in coordinating international efforts to support Ukraine’s recovery from the war. He advocated for a four-stage approach: relief, reconstruction, modernization and accession to the EU. Mr. Kirkegaard also argued that Ukraine’s reconstruction process would contribute to increased economic opportunities throughout Europe. As well, he underscored the need for the international community to continue providing financial and military support to Ukraine to counter Russian aggression.

Reports, resolutions and elections of committee and sub-committee members

The Committee’s rapporteurs presented draft three reports¹⁸ and two resolutions¹⁹ for consideration and amendment. These reports and resolutions were adopted during the meeting. Lastly, the Committee discussed future activities and studies, and elected committee and sub-committee officers.

Canadian participation:

¹⁸ The Economics and Security Committee’s reports were: [Strategic and Economic Challenges: Posed by Corruption](#); [The Western Balkans: Russia’s War on Ukraine and the Region’s Enduring Challenges](#); and [Strategic Trade Challenges: Securing Essential Industries and Supply Chains](#).

¹⁹ The Economics and Security Committee’s resolutions were entitled, [The Corruption–Security Nexus](#); and [Russia’s War on Ukraine: Economic Consequences and Responses](#).

Canadians who participated in the Committee's deliberations included: Senator Mohamed-Iqbal Ravalia; Cheryl Gallant MP; and Shelby Kramp-Neuman, MP.

4. Political Committee

The Political Committee met on Saturday, 19 November 2022, and on Sunday, 20 November 2022.²⁰

Six speakers addressed the Committee and responded to questions and comments:

- José Manuel Albares, Minister of Foreign Affairs, European Union and Cooperation of Spain;
- Javier Colomina, NATO Deputy Assistant Secretary General for Political Affairs and Security Policy, and the NATO Secretary General's Special Representative for the Caucasus and Central Asia;
- Veerle Nouwens, Senior Research Fellow and Head of the Indo-Pacific Programme at the Royal United Services Institute;
- Clint Reach, International Defence Researcher at the RAND Corporation;
- Andriy Kostin, Prosecutor General of Ukraine; and
- Haizam Amirah-Fernández, Mediterranean and Arab World Analyst at Elcano Royal Institute.

The Spanish Perspective in the Context of Russia's Invasion of Ukraine and the Challenges on NATO's Southern Flank

Minister Albares contended that, by strengthening ties with each other, legislators from NATO member can "buttress the transatlantic relationship." He also highlighted the need for continued cooperation between NATO and the EU to address defence and security issues of mutual concern.

Minister Albares condemned Russia's full-scale invasion of Ukraine, urging NATO member countries to remain united vis-à-vis Russia's acts of aggression. He also stressed that NATO member countries should cooperate to ensure that such crimes are fully investigated.

In relation to NATO's Southern Flank, Minister Albares outlined several issues affecting countries in the region, including climate change, food insecurity and terrorism. As well, he emphasized the need to ensure greater security and stability in the Alliance's Southern Flank. Minister Albares characterized the reinforcement of the Southern Flank as a priority for Spain and other NATO member countries that are involved in that region.

Priorities for NATO after the Madrid Summit: Keeping NATO Fit for Purpose in the New Strategic Environment

Deputy Assistant Secretary General Colomina outlined seven key areas for the Alliance:

- strengthening NATO's defence and deterrence posture;

²⁰ For a detailed summary of the Political Committee's meeting, see NATO PA, [2022 Madrid Meeting Summaries](#).

- enhancing societal resilience and protecting critical infrastructure;
- developing tailored partnerships with like-minded partners around the world;
- increasing the focus on NATO's Southern Flank;
- addressing geostrategic competition with China and Russia;
- completing Finland's and Sweden's accession to NATO; and
- strengthening NATO's unity and transatlantic bond.

Deputy Assistant Secretary General Colomina also responded to questions and comments from committee members, including Jennifer O'Connell, MP. Ms. O'Connell asked about NATO's efforts to address hybrid threats, particularly in terms of cyber-attacks conducted against NATO member countries. In response, Deputy Assistant Secretary General Colomina stated that NATO had taken several steps to address cyber-attacks and other threats, including through the launch of the Defence Innovation Accelerator for the North Atlantic (DIANA).²¹

China After the 20th Party Congress: Policy Outcomes and Implications for Global Affairs and Consideration

Ms. Nouwens argued that China under President Xi Jinping has sought to become a "global rule- and norm- setter" and to challenge the international rules-based order. She also drew attention to China's assertiveness in the Indo-Pacific region, particularly in relation to the South China Sea and the Taiwan Strait.

Ms. Nouwens responded to questions and comments from committee members, including from Julie Dzerowicz, MP. Ms. Dzerowicz asked Ms. Nouwens to share her thoughts on China's political interference – and the alleged presence of Chinese government police stations – in Canada and other NATO member countries. In responding to this question, Ms. Nouwens observed that some Chinese diplomats and officials have conducted acts of political interference in foreign countries that "cross national laws of these countries."

Russian War against Ukraine: Military and Political Aspects

Discussing Russia's full-scale invasion of Ukraine, Mr. Reach argued that "history shaped Russian national identity, while Ukraine's national identity [has been] characterized by its independent streak." He maintained that since 1999, Russia's politics and style of government has become increasingly nationalistic and autocratic. As well, Mr. Reach remarked that NATO should strive to ensure that, in the long-term, "Russian identity policy [returns] to Western-friendly approach."

Before concluding his presentation, Mr. Reach responded to questions and comments from committee members, including from Julie Dzerowicz, MP, on Russian political

²¹ The North American Regional Office of the Defence Innovation Accelerator for the North Atlantic (DIANA) will be headquartered in Halifax, Canada; the regional office is expected to be operational by summer 2024. See Department of National Defence, [Minister Blair announces defence investments in Halifax at 15th Halifax International Security Forum](#), News release, 17 November 2023; and NATO, [Defence Innovation Accelerator for the North Atlantic \(DIANA\)](#).

interference and cyberattacks against NATO member countries, and from Cheryl Gallant, MP, on anti-war movements within Russia.

Russia's Aggression and War Crimes in Ukraine

Ukrainian Prosecutor General Kostin acknowledged NATO's support for Ukraine, while urging Allies to continue providing Ukraine's Armed Forces with military support. He also called on the international community to hold Russian officials and other individuals accountable for crimes of aggression in Ukraine, including through the establishment of a Special Tribunal for the Crime of Aggression and an International Compensation Commission.

Finally, Ukrainian Prosecutor General Kostin estimated that, as of November 2022, there were up to 47,000 reported cases of crimes of aggressions involving Russian Armed Forces in Ukraine, including sexual violence, forced displacement, and extrajudicial killings. He also noted that more than 8,000 civilians had died during the war in Ukraine as of December 2022.

The Evolving Political and Security Landscape in the Maghreb

Mr. Amirah-Fernández discussed the current political and security situation in the MENA region, with an emphasis on recent events affecting the Maghreb. He asserted that irregular migration, among other regional challenges, affects stability along NATO's Southern Flank.

Mr. Amirah-Fernández drew attention to Russia's and China's increased involvement in the MENA region. He also stated that there has been a rise in anti-European narratives among countries in that region.

Mr. Amirah-Fernández concluded his presentation by responding to questions and comments from committee members, including from Julie Dzerowicz, MP. Ms. Dzerowicz asked Mr. Amirah-Fernández about China's foreign interference in Mali and other African countries. In his response, Mr. Amirah-Fernández noted that China's had increased its economic influence in the MENA region.

Reports, resolutions and elections of committee and sub-committee members

The Committee considered and adopted three draft reports²² and one resolution before discussing future activities and studies.²³

During consideration of the Committee's draft reports, Ms. O'Connell proposed an amendment to the draft report on the Indo-Pacific. Among other things, the amendment suggested the addition of a reference to Canada's economic, political, people-to-people, trade and investment ties with the Indo-Pacific region. The amendment was accepted.

²² The Political Committee's reports were: [NATO's Political and Security Adaptation in Response to Russia's War: Assessing the New Strategic Concept and the Implementation of the Madrid Summit Decisions](#); [NATO and the Indo-Pacific Region](#); and [Developments in Afghanistan: Causes, Consequences, and Lessons Learned](#).

²³ The Political Committee's resolution was entitled, [NATO Post Madrid](#).

Lastly, the Committee elected committee and sub-committee officers. Ms. Gallant was re-elected as a vice-chair of the Political Committee.

Canadian participation:

Canadians who participated in the Committee's deliberations included: Julie Dzerowicz, MP; Cheryl Gallant, MP; and Jennifer O'Connell, MP.

5. Science and Technology Committee

The Science and Technology Committee met on Sunday, 20 November 2022.²⁴

The following two speakers addressed the Committee:

- Diana Morant, Minister for Science and Innovation of Spain; and
- Major General José L. Murga, Spanish representative to the NATO Science and Technology Council.

Spain's Innovation Policy: Challenges and Opportunities

Minister Morant contended that science and innovation could provide solutions to issues affecting Spain, such as environmental disasters, public health emergencies and heat waves. She also commented about the need to use science and innovation to counter cyberattacks by Russia and other actors.

Minister Morant discussed the Government of Spain's policies on science and innovation. She indicated that since 2020, Spain has doubled the Ministry of Science and Innovation's budget, launched a program for attracting and retaining scientists, and amended the country's Science, Technology and Innovation Law.

Minister Morant argued that strengthening public-private partnerships can improve knowledge transfer between the private and public sectors. She also maintained that enhancing corporate innovation contributes to the further development of such sectors as aerospace, clean technologies and clean energy.

Before concluding her remarks, Minister Morant responded to questions and comments from committee members, including from Cheryl Gallant, MP. Ms. Gallant asked about Spain's efforts to reduce its green house gas emissions, while also addressing its citizens' energy needs. Minister Morant responded that the Government of Spain has been working with energy firms to not only reduce their emission levels, but also to develop technologies, including in relation to the production of clean energy.

The Priorities of the Spanish Innovation Policy in Defence

Major General Murga spoke about the Spanish Ministry of Defence's policies on research and development (R&D), and innovation. He drew attention to the Ministry's 2021–2027 strategy on R&D and Innovation, which guides the development of defence technology in

²⁴ For a detailed summary of the Science and Technology Committee's meeting, see NATO PA, [2022 Madrid Meeting Summaries](#).

Spain. Major General Murga also asserted that Spain's R&D policies for defence are consistent with NATO's technological priorities.

Major General Murga noted that one of the Spanish Ministry of Defence's main objectives is the development of defence technologies. Such technologies include weapons systems, quantum technologies, propulsion technologies, precision guided munitions and artificial intelligence.

Lastly, Major General Murga characterized Spain as an "active contributor" to NATO's Science and Technology Organization, Innovation Fund and DIANA. He then responded to questions and comments from committee members, including from Cheryl Gallant, MP, on Spain's innovation policies.

Reports, resolutions and elections of committee and sub-committee members

The Committee's rapporteurs presented three draft reports²⁵ and a resolution²⁶ for consideration and amendment. During consideration of the Committee's report on climate change, Ms. Gallant suggested that the report include wording recognizing the need to ensure that NATO's policies on carbon emission reduction does not compromise the Alliance's technological and military capabilities.

Lastly, committee members discussed future activities and events. They also elected and re-elected committee and sub-committee officers.

Canadian participation:

Canadians who participated in the Committee's deliberations included: Senator Mohamed-Iqbal Ravalia; Rachel Blaney, MP; Cheryl Gallant, MP; and Shelby Kramp-Neuman, MP.

D. Plenary Sitting

The Plenary Sitting of the NATO PA's 68th Annual Session was held on Monday, 21 November 2022.²⁷

The following individuals addressed the plenary sitting in-person or virtually:

- Jens Stoltenberg, NATO Secretary General;
- Gerald Connolly, outgoing NATO PA President;
- Pedro Sánchez, Prime Minister of Spain;

²⁵ The Science and Technology Committee's reports were: [Strengthening Alliance S & T Resilience](#); [Climate Change Mitigation and Adaption: the Role of Technology](#); and [Technological Innovation for Future Warfare](#).

²⁶ The Science and Technology Committee's resolution was entitled, [Climate Change and International Security: NATO's Agenda](#).

²⁷ For a summary of the Plenary Sitting, see NATO PA, [2022 - PLENARY MEETING SUMMARY - ANNUAL SESSION MADRID](#). As well, the NATO PA released the following news releases on Plenary Sitting: NATO PA, [French Senator condemns Russia, backs Ukraine, as she is elected NATO PA President](#), News release, 21 November 2022; NATO PA, [NATO PA wraps up Annual Session keen to bolster defence and deterrence, tighten pressure on Russia to end Ukraine war](#), New release, 21 November 2022; and NATO PA, [Zelenskyy addresses NATO PA as lawmakers underscore support for Ukraine's resistance against Russia's "terrorist" regime](#), News release, 21 November 2022.

- Senator Ander Gil, President of the Senate of Spain;
- Meritxell Batet, President of the Congress of Deputies;
- Volodymyr Zelenskyy, President of Ukraine; and
- Olha Stefanishyna, Ukrainian Deputy Prime Minister for European and Euro-Atlantic Integration, and the 2022 recipient of the NATO PA's Women for Peace and Security award.

At the plenary sitting, NATO Secretary General Stoltenberg responded to several questions and comments from delegates, including from Julie Dzerowicz, MP. Ms. Dzerowicz stated that Canada was honoured to have hosted Secretary General Stoltenberg in the Canadian Arctic in August 2022 before asking the Secretary General about the “next steps for NATO in strengthening Euro-Atlantic security in the Arctic.” Ms. Dzerowicz also asked the Secretary General for his thoughts on “how prepared NATO is to address [the warfare of the 21st century],” which includes: cyberattacks, election interference, the dissemination of disinformation and misinformation, and the presence of foreign actors in Canada, the United Kingdom and other NATO member countries.

At the plenary sitting, participating delegates also adopted the following six resolutions, which provide policy recommendations:²⁸

- Strengthening the Cyber Resilience of Allied Societies that, among other matters, highlights Allied efforts to prevent, deter and counter cyber-attacks, and calls on NATO countries to implement the Cyber Defence Pledge, the Comprehensive Cyber Defensive Policy and the new Strategic Concept.
- Supporting NATO's Post-Madrid Summit Deterrence and Defence Initiatives that, among other matters, highlights Allied military, economic, political and humanitarian support for Ukraine, and expresses concerns about the re-emergence of Afghanistan as a “haven for terrorism.”
- The Corruption-Security Nexus that, among other matters, characterizes Russia as a kleptocratic state that promotes and fosters corruption abroad and domestically, and urges NATO countries to establish a Centre for Democratic Resilience at NATO Headquarters.
- Russia's War on Ukraine: Economic Consequences and Responses that, among other matters, notes the EU's and the Group of Seven's decision to implement a cap on the price paid for Russian oil, and condemns Russia's acts of violence and human rights violations in Ukraine, which include attacks on civilians and economic infrastructure.
- NATO Post-Madrid Summit: Fit for Purpose in the New Strategic Era that, among other matters, calls on NATO countries to clearly characterize the current regime in Russia as terrorist; cooperate to establish an international tribunal to prosecute acts of aggression committed by Russia in Ukraine; and “impose [upon Russia] an obligation to make full reparation of damage loss or injury under international compensation mechanism.” As well, this resolution provides a list of security challenges that NATO countries face, including irregular migration and human trafficking, that were added to the

²⁸ For the complete text of the six resolutions, see NATO PA, [2022 Madrid Annual Session Policy Recommendations](#).

list following the adoption of an amendment to the resolution proposed by Canadian delegates.

- Climate Change and International Security – NATO’s Agenda that, among other matters, acknowledges the effects of climate change on the security environment, and welcomes Canada’s decision to host a NATO Climate Change and Security Centre of Excellence.

These six resolutions followed two other resolutions adopted at the NATO PA’s 2022 Spring Session in May 2022, entitled *Standing with Ukraine* and *Confronting Russia’s Threat*.

Prior to the conclusion of the plenary sitting, Senator Joëlle Garriaud-Maylam of France was elected to succeed Gerald Connolly of the United States as President of the NATO PA. As well, delegates elected five NATO PA vice-presidents: Zaida Cantera of Spain; Nicu Falcoi of Romania; Kevan Jones of the United Kingdom; Linda Sánchez of the United States; and Michał Szczerba of Poland.²⁹

E. Women in Security and Defence Luncheon

On 20 November 2022, the Spanish Delegation to the NATO PA hosted a luncheon, entitled “Women in Security and Defence,” during which participating women delegates discussed the role of women in security and defence with four women members of the Spanish Armed Forces. Senator Jane Cordy, Julie Dzerowicz, MP; Rachel Blaney, MP; Cheryl Gallant, MP; Shelby Kramp-Neuman, MP; Christine Normandin, MP; and Jennifer O’Connell, MP, attended the luncheon.³⁰

F. Reception at the Royal Palace of Madrid

On the evening of Sunday, 20 November 2022, NATO PA delegates attended a reception at the Royal Palace of Madrid, where they met King Felipe VI and Queen Letizia of Spain.³¹

King Felipe VI provided some remarks during the reception. He underscored that: “Russia’s illegal and unjustifiable war of aggression against Ukraine has not only caused the ominous spread of death and destruction throughout its territory, but it has also brought to NATO’s doorstep an extremely serious and unacceptable damage to peace and a rules-based international order.”

With a focus on the NATO PA, King Felipe VI highlighted the Assembly’s contributions to Allied efforts to address a wide range of defence and security challenges, including cybersecurity, climate change and security, democratic resilience and energy resilience.

²⁹ For more information, see NATO PA, [French Senator condemns Russia, backs Ukraine, as she is elected NATO PA President](#), News release, 21 November 2022

³⁰ Parl Diplomacy (@ParlDiplomacy), “[The women in #CANA’s delegation to #NATOPAMadrid joined their counterparts for a networking luncheon for women in security and defence.....](#),” X, 23 November 2022, 3:20pm.

³¹ For the complete text of King Felipe VI of Spain’s remarks to the NATO PA delegates, see Spain, [Casa Real, Palabras de S.M. El Rey en La Audiencia a Los Participantes En La 68ª Sesión Anual de la Asamblea Parlamentaria de La Otan](#).

King Felipe VI also underscored that the NATO PA provides NATO “with an essential link with Allied societies, something crucial for the democratic values we all stand for.”

OTHER MEETINGS

On 18 November 2022, the Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association delegates met with Canada’s Ambassador to Spain and Andorra and other members of the Canadian diplomatic corps to discuss bilateral relations, the current political and economic situation in Spain, and shared commitments to transatlantic security.³²

Respectfully submitted,

Julie Dzerowicz, MP
Chair of the Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association

Travel Costs

ASSOCIATION	Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association
ACTIVITY	68 th Annual Session
DESTINATION	Madrid, Spain
DATES	From November 18 to 21, 2022
LEGATION	
SENATE	Hon. Pierre-Hugues Boisvenu Hon. Jane Cordy Hon. Mohamed-Iqbal Ravalia
HOUSE OF COMMONS	Julie Dzerowicz Rachel Blaney Cheryl Gallant Shelby Kramp-Neuman Christine Normandin Jennifer O’Connell

³² Parl Diplomacy (@ParlDiplomacy), “[On the eve of #NATOPAMadrid, #CANA met with Ambassador @WDrukier of the @CanEmbSpain to discuss bilateral relations..](#),” X, 21 November 2022, 2:02pm.

STAFF	Céline Ethier Andrés León
TRANSPORTATION	\$ 29,640.85
ACCOMMODATION	\$ 10,960.21
HOSPITALITY	\$ 0.00
PER DIEMS	\$ 9,806.75
OFFICIAL GIFTS	\$ 0.00
MISCELLANEOUS	\$ 17.04
TOTAL	\$ 50,424.85