

Report of the Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association

65th Annual Session

London, United Kingdom

October 11-14, 2019

Report

INTRODUCTION

The Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association has the honour to report on its participation in the 65th Annual Session of the North Atlantic Treaty Organization Parliamentary Assembly (NATO PA), which took place in London, United Kingdom from October 11-14, 2019. The Canadian delegation comprised the following members:

- The Honourable Joseph Day, Senator, leader of the Canadian delegation;
- The Honourable Peter Boehm, Senator;
- The Honourable Pierre-Hugues Boisvenu, Senator;
- The Honourable Jane Cordy, Senator;
- The Honourable Pierre Dalphond, Senator;
- The Honourable Stephen Greene, Senator; and
- The Honourable Vernon White, Senator.

The delegation was accompanied by Jean-François Pagé, Association Secretary. and Katherine Simonds, Association Advisor.

THE NATO PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY

Established in 1955, the NATO PA is an inter-parliamentary organization that brings together legislators from the national parliaments of the 29 member countries of NATO,¹ as well as 12 associate member countries.² The PA is institutionally separate and independent from the official NATO structure, but serves as a liaison for NATO and member parliaments.³ The NATO PA aims to strengthen parliamentary awareness, understanding and oversight of defence and security issues, while also enhancing the transparency of NATO policies. The Assembly also plays a significant role in deepening the transatlantic relationship that underpins the NATO Alliance.

The NATO PA has five thematic Committees:

¹ The 29 member countries of NATO are: Belgium, Canada, Denmark, France, Iceland, Italy, Luxembourg, the Netherlands, Norway, Portugal, the United Kingdom, the United States, Greece, Turkey, Germany, Spain, the Czech Republic, Hungary, Poland, Bulgaria, Estonia, Latvia, Lithuania, Romania, Slovakia, Slovenia, Albania, Croatia, and Montenegro.

² The associate delegations are from: Armenia, Austria, Azerbaijan, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Finland, Georgia, the Republic of North Macedonia, the Republic of Moldova, Serbia, Sweden, Switzerland, and Ukraine.

³ See North Atlantic Treaty Organization Parliamentary Assembly (NATO PA), "[Our Mission](#)."

- the Defence and Security Committee;
- the Political Committee;
- the Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security;
- the Science and Technology Committee; and
- the Economics and Security Committee.

Each of these committees has one or two sub-committees. Similar to the practices of parliamentary committees, NATO PA committee members hear from defence and security experts and conduct fact-finding missions throughout the year, which culminates in the drafting of reports and resolutions. Committee members consider these draft reports and resolutions during NATO PA Sessions.

During the Annual Session, each committee and sub-committee debates, amends, votes on, and adopts resolutions. The resolutions adopted during these meetings then become policy recommendations that are voted on by the Assembly as a whole during the Plenary Session. While recommendations adopted by the Assembly are not legally binding, they are distributed to the governments and parliaments of NATO member and associate member nations. The NATO Secretary General also provides a written response to each policy recommendation.

THE 2019 ANNUAL SESSION

The 65th Annual Session was hosted by the Parliament of the United Kingdom and chaired by the NATO PA President, Ms. Madeleine Moon (U.K.). Parliamentarians, experts, and observers from NATO member countries, as well as nations in North Africa, the Middle East and Central Asia, participated in the session.

Discussions were guided by the following topics:

- Security challenges in the North Atlantic;
- NATO operations, in Eastern Europe, Afghanistan and Iraq;
- Regional dynamics in the Gulf;
- Border security;
- NATO-Russia relations;
- Climate change and international security;
- NATO's nuclear deterrence;
- The situation in Ukraine;
- The efficacy of international sanctions;

- China's international presence and implications for the Alliance;
- The state of NATO's anti-submarine warfare capabilities; and
- Recent developments in northern Syria.

The program included meetings of the Standing Committee,⁴ each of the thematic committees and sub-committees, as well as a Plenary Session. A NATO PA coordination meeting involving members of the Bureau (President, Vice-Presidents and Treasurer), Chairpersons of Committees and Subcommittees, and Rapporteurs was also held.

Delegates also had the opportunity to meet with counterparts of their respective political groups from across the NATO Alliance countries: Conservative, Christian Democrat and Associates; Alliance of Liberals and Democrats; and, Socialists. During those meetings, NATO parliamentarians from similar political parties discuss issues of mutual interest to their own parties and constituents, further solidifying the representative nature of the NATO PA and advancing the parliamentary diplomacy that takes place during its sessions.

A. Standing Committee

The Standing Committee met on Sunday, 13 October 2019, to receive briefings from the Assembly's leadership and to plan for activities in 2020. NATO PA President, Madeleine Moon, chaired the meeting.

A number of procedural matters pertaining to the Session's activities were detailed by the NATO PA President and Secretary General. The Standing Committee considered the proposed candidates for positions on the Assembly's Bureau. Incoming Secretary General, Ruxandra Popa, then presented the proposed list of reports and activities for 2020, noting that there was continuity in the themes that would be examined by the NATO PA in the year ahead. The list was approved by the Standing Committee. Dr. Karl Lamers (Germany) noted that the Working Group on Education and Communication about NATO adopted a report outlining the best practices of NATO PA members and explained that the Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security will continue to examine this issue going forward.

The Treasurer, Marc Angel (Luxembourg) presented the 2020 draft budget to the Standing Committee, which took into account the Assembly's legal obligation to comply with Belgian legislation related to health insurance and the Provident Fund, as well as Belgium's rate of inflation. The proposed draft budget totalled 4,045,125 euros and was adopted unanimously.

Future meetings of the NATO PA were discussed. The President also thanked outgoing Secretary General Hobbs for his service. Incoming Secretary General, Ruxandra Popa, put forward the candidacy of Henrik Bliddal, Director of the Science and Technology Committee, for the position of Deputy Secretary General, noting that a transparent and

⁴ The Standing Committee of the NATO PA is comprised of Heads of National Delegations, Bureau members (President, Vice Presidents and Treasurer), and the Secretary General. It has various political and administrative duties, including coordinating the overall work of the Assembly.

competitive selection process had been undertaken. The Standing Committee voted to approve the proposed candidate.

Canadian Participation:

Senator Joseph Day represented the Canadian delegation at the Standing Committee meeting.

B. Committee Business

NATO PA Committees met simultaneously over the course of four days from 11–14 October 2019. During those meetings, Committees debated the reports and resolutions that had been first presented at the Spring Session in Bratislava, Slovakia in June 2019. They were open for final amendments before being put to a vote in their respective Committees. In addition, the Committee meetings were an opportunity for delegates to hear from senior military and government officials from the British government and NATO headquarters, as well as academic experts and representatives of non-governmental organizations, on issues of interest to the Alliance.

1. Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security ⁵

The Civil Dimension of Security Committee heard from speakers on a wide-range of issues:

- Jamie Shea, Professor of Strategy and Security at the University of Exeter and Senior Fellow at Friends of Europe addressed *The Continued Relevance of NATO* during a panel discussion on *NATO at 70*;
- Sanj Srikanthan, Senior Vice President, Europe and Executive Director at the International Rescue Committee delivered a presentation entitled *Is the refugee crisis in Europe over?*;
- William Browder, CEO of Hermitage Capital Management spoke about *Corruption and Human Rights Situation in Russia*; and
- Orysia Lutsevych, Research Fellow and Manager of the Russian Forum of the Russia and Eurasia Programme at Chatham House joined Senator Cordy during a panel discussion on Ukraine.

During William Browder's presentation, Senator Cordy thanked Mr. Browder for his 2017 appearance before the Senate Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs and International Trade during its consideration of the *Justice for Victims of Corrupt Foreign Officials Act (Sergei Magnitsky Law)*. She also inquired about what parliamentarians can do to address human rights violations in Russia. Mr. Browder noted that the passing of the Sergei Magnitsky Law in Canada had an important impact on his efforts to encourage the adoption of similar legislation in other countries, given Canada's international reputation

⁵ A detailed summary of each Committee meeting, prepared by the Secretariat of the NATO PA, is forthcoming. Those summaries are posted on the website of the NATO PA.

as an honest broker. He suggested that parliamentarians in countries that have adopted Magnitsky laws could urge countries that have not to take action, using their legislation as an example of what can be accomplished.

The Committee's rapporteurs also presented their respective draft reports and resolutions.⁶ The floor was then opened for amendments; the reports and resolutions were subsequently adopted. Finally, the Committee discussed its studies and activities for 2020 and elected Committee and Sub-committee officers.

Canadian Participation:

Senator Cordy, Rapporteur of the Sub-Committee on Democratic Governance, presented her report entitled *Ukraine: Five Years After the Revolution of Dignity*. Senator Vernon White also participated in the Committee's deliberations.

2. Defence and Security Committee

Seven speakers addressed the Defence and Security Committee during its meetings:

- Air Chief Marshal Sir Stuart Peach, Chairman of the Military Committee of NATO, discussed *NATO at 70 – Current Threats and Security Challenges, Preparing for the Future*;
- Professor Michael Clarke, Distinguished Fellow at the Royal United Services Institute (RUSI), provided an overview of *UK Defence Priorities*;
- Bruno Tétrais, Deputy Director of the Foundation for Strategic Research, and Tom Plant, Director of Proliferation and Nuclear Policy at RUSI, participated in a panel discussion on *Post-INF Challenges: Nuclear Deterrence and Arms Control in a New Strategic Environment*;
- Michael Singh, Managing Director and Senior Fellow at the Washington Institute for Near East Policy, provided a presentation on *Iran's Regional and Global Challenge: Renewing a Multilateral Strategy toward Iran*;
- Keir Giles, Research Director at the Conflict Studies Research Centre, delivered a presentation entitled on *Russia is back! (where it started)*;
- Commodore Marcel Hallé, Deputy Chief of Staff Plans, Allied Maritime Command Northwood, joined Sir Nicholas Soames (United Kingdom) during a panel discussion on *Evolving Security Challenges in the North Atlantic*; and
- Senator David Fawcett (Australia) described national security and defence measures taken by Australia to respond to hybrid warfare threats in a presentation entitled *Countering Foreign Interference and Espionage*.

⁶ The reports adopted by the Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security were the following: *NATO at 70: Reaffirming the Alliance's Values*; *Border Security*; and *Ukraine: Five Years After the Revolution of Dignity*. For the resolutions, see NATO PA, "[Adopted Resolutions](#)," London 2019.

During Commodore Marcel Hallé's presentation, Senator Boisvenu asked about Canada's contribution to NATO operations in the North Atlantic and whether recent upgrades to Canada's naval fleet will help NATO respond to the security challenges it faces in the sea domain over the next decade. Commodore Halle replied that improvements to Canada's naval capability contribute to NATO readiness, particularly in the High North. He also mentioned that NATO is examining how it can regain dominance in the field of anti-submarine warfare.

Three reports and two resolutions were considered and adopted during the Committee's meetings.⁷ The Committee then discussed future studies and activities, and elected Committee officers.

Canadian Participation:

As General Rapporteur, Senator Day presented the report entitled *A New Era for Nuclear Deterrence? Modernisation, Arms Control, and Allied Nuclear Forces* and moderated the discussion that followed. He also presented a related resolution as well as another on recent developments in Afghanistan. Senator Dalphond and Boisvenu also participated in the Defence and Security Committee meetings.

3. Economics and Security Committee

Three speakers addressed the Economics and Security Committee:

- Gabriel Siles-Brügge, Associate Professor in Public Policy, University of Warwick, outlined *British trade policy in the wake of the UK's Withdrawal from the EU, including the Future Trade Relationship with the EU, the U.S. and Canada* ;
- William Browder, CEO of Hermitage Capital Management, focused his remarks on *The Efficacy of International Sanctions - the Magnitsky Act and Russia*; and
- Sir Hugh Bayley, Commissioner of the Independent Commission for Aid Impact (ICAI) and former President of the NATO PA, outlined *the Work of ICAI and the Development-Security Nexus*.

Senator Boehm intervened during the discussion in relation to the UK's oversight of official development assistance (ODA). He asked about the level of transparency related to the UK's ODA spending and challenges that may stem from the UK's commitment to allocate 0.7% of gross national income (GNI) to ODA. Sir Bayley indicated that ICAI was founded in response to questions from the public and in the House of Commons about foreign aid spending. He explained that larger amounts of ODA spending require oversight and grading, such as the traffic light system, to evaluate impact. While a good measure of transparency has largely been achieved, he commented that it can be difficult to spend funds of that volume given complexities in aid delivery on the ground. As a result,

⁷ The [reports](#) adopted by the Defence and Security Committee were the following: *Evolving Security in the North Atlantic*; *A New Era for Nuclear Deterrence? Modernisation, Arms Control, and Allied Nuclear Forces*; and *NATO Exercises: Evolution and Lessons Learned*. The Resolutions are available on the NATO PA website: "[Adopted Resolutions](#)," London 2019.

funds can sometimes be “dumped” into multilateral entities, such as UN specialized agencies and the World Bank, in order to meet spending requirements.

Following amendments and debate, the Committee adopted three reports and one resolution.⁸ The Committee then discussed future studies and activities, and elected Committee and Sub-committee officers.

Canadian participation:

The following Canadian delegates participated in the Economics and Security Committee meeting: Senator Boehm and Senator Greene.

4. Political Committee

The Political Committee heard from four speakers:

- The Right Honourable Dominic Raab, MP, Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs of the United Kingdom, outlined the UK’s foreign policy priorities;
- Michael Clarke, Distinguished Fellow at the Royal United Services Institute, provided a presentation entitled *Transatlantic relations; the state of play*;
- Sanam Vakil, Senior Research Fellow with the Middle East and North African Programme at Chatham House, discussed *Regional security dynamics in the Gulf*, and
- Charles Parton, Senior Associate Fellow at RUSI, described his research findings in a presentation on *China’s role in the world and implications for the Alliance*.

Following the presentation on China’s role in the world, Senator Boehm raised the issue of “hostage diplomacy” and the arbitrary detention of Canadians following the arrest of Meng Wanzhou. He underscored the importance of solidarity among like-minded countries.

The Committee’s rapporteurs presented their respective draft reports and draft resolutions, which were adopted after the Committee considered final amendments.⁹ Finally, the Committee discussed its studies and activities for 2020 and elected Committee and Sub-committee officers.

Canadian participation:

⁸ *The Economics and Security Committee adopted the following reports: Economic Sanctions as a Tool of Foreign Policy; North American and European Approaches to Digital Markets and Cyber Security; and The Republic of North Macedonia: Political Change, NATO Accession and Economic Transition. The Resolutions are available on the NATO PA website: “[Adopted Resolutions](#),” London 2019.*

⁹ *The reports adopted by the Political Committee were the following: NATO at 70: Why the Alliance Remains Indispensable; Nato-Russia Relations: A Snapshot; and Security and Stability in Africa: Challenges and Opportunities for NATO. The Resolutions are available on the NATO PA website: “[Adopted Resolutions](#),” London 2019.*

Senator Boehm and Senator Greene participated in the meetings of the Political Committee.

5. Science and Technology Committee

The Science and Technology Committee met and heard from four speakers:

- Bryan Wells, NATO's Chief Scientist, outlined NATO's science and technology priorities;
- Catherine Warner, Director of the Centre for Maritime Research and Experimentation at NATO's Science and Technology Organization, and James Henry Bergeron, Political Advisor at NATO's Allied Maritime Command, participated in a panel discussion on *Bridging the Gap between S&T and Operators: Maritime Perspectives*; and
- General (Retired) Tom Middendorp, Chairman of the international Military Committee on Climate and Security and Senior Associate Fellow at the Clingendael Institute, focused his remarks on *Climate Change and Security*.

Following amendments and debate, the Committee adopted three reports and one resolution.¹⁰ The Committee then discussed future studies and activities, and elected Committee and Sub-committee officers.

C. Plenary Sitting

The Plenary Sitting of the 65th Annual Session took place on Monday, 14 October 2019. President Madeleine Moon presided.

In her opening remarks, President Moon underlined that, despite the current preoccupation with national issues within the UK, threats affecting the Alliance extend beyond domestic politics, and that NATO member states must focus their efforts regionally and globally. She mentioned the Turkish incursion into northern Syria, noting that Turkey has long been worried about security threats on its southern border. She also noted that other NATO member states have expressed concerns that this action could trigger further instability in the region, result in further civilian deaths, and allow Daesh fighters to escape custody. President Moon asserted that many NATO states are failing to take responsibility for citizens from their countries who fought for Daesh as well as for their children. She encouraged NATO member states to continue to engage in dialogue to resolve the situation. More generally, she also raised the importance of parliamentarians promoting public awareness about NATO, especially among young generations. She commended the Assembly for demonstrating its unambiguous support for the Euro-Atlantic aspirations of Georgia and Ukraine. President Moon reminded

¹⁰ The Science and Technology Committee reports adopted by the Committee were entitled: *Artificial Intelligence: Implications for NATO's Armed Forces*; *NATO's Anti-Submarine Warfare: Rebuilding Capacity, Preparing for the Future*; and *NATO in the Cyber Age: Strengthening Security and Defence, Stabilising Deterrence*. The Resolutions are available on the NATO PA website: "[Adopted Resolutions](#)," London 2019.

delegates that London was home to NATO's first headquarters from 1949-1952. She closed by thanking NATO parliamentarians for their important contributions to the Assembly.

The Plenary then heard from the Right Honourable Ben Wallace, Secretary of State for Defence of the United Kingdom. Secretary Wallace referred to NATO as an Alliance of mutual defence. He indicated that NATO's adversaries have realized that they cannot win by playing by the rules, and, as a result, are trying to change them. Secretary Wallace referred to the Chief of the Russian General Staff Valery Gerasimov's 2013 article describing some of the hybrid warfare methods that would be used by Russia, quoting him as saying "long distance contactless actions against enemies are the main means of achieving combat and operational goals." Secretary Wallace noted that all Allies, particularly those in the Baltics, are familiar with daily cyber and disinformation attacks, as well as attempts to corrupt officials – efforts designed to divide and weaken the Alliance. However, he stated that defending against modern threats takes investment and that the UK's overall defence budget will total 41.23 billion pounds, making them the leading spenders on defence in Europe. It is Secretary Wallace's view that collective forward momentum will keep NATO unified. Underscoring that the Alliance cannot be static, he noted that China and Russia are interested in space capabilities and that NATO states must keep pace with these developments.

The Honourable Pedro Roque (Portugal), Vice-President of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Mediterranean, President of the First Standing Committee on Political and Security-related Cooperation and President Emeritus addressed the plenary, outlining a number of issues with which the Mediterranean Assembly is currently seized. These issues include: security developments in the Middle East and North Africa, such as the repatriation of foreign fighters; Israel-Palestine; and the situation in Mozambique. He urged deeper ties between the Mediterranean PA and the NATO PA.

Next, election results for the positions of President, Vice-President and Treasurer were announced. Ms. Madeleine Moon was acclaimed President of the NATO PA for a second term following an uncontested election. A tribute to outgoing members of the Assembly then took place. Senator Day's contributions to the Assembly since 2002 were acknowledged by the President. Over the years, Senator Day has served as Vice-Chair and Chair of the Political Committee's subcommittee on Transatlantic Relations, Chairman of the Defence and Security Committee, Rapporteur of the Defence and Security Committee, and Vice-President of the Assembly.

The contributions of outgoing Secretary General, David Hobbs, were also acknowledged.

Secretary General of NATO, Jens Stoltenberg, then addressed the assembly. He underscored that, for more than 70 years, the Alliance has contributed to peace and security worldwide. While the 70th anniversary of the Alliance is a reason to celebrate achievements, he cautioned parliamentarians against complacency. The Secretary General indicated that the Alliance's values are under pressure, that the global balance of power is shifting with the rise of China, which presents opportunities as well as risks given the threats China has asserted against its neighbours and its disregard for international law. He also pointed out that instability in the MENA region continues, and that the lines between peace and war are being blurred by Russian hybrid tactics that

undermine values, institutions and democracies. The Secretary General focused his remarks on the situation in Afghanistan, developments in arms control, particularly the demise of *the Intermediate-Range Nuclear Forces Treaty*, and disruptive new technologies, explaining that NATO leaders will discuss these issues at the 2019 NATO Leaders Summit in London. Innovation and the rapid pace of technological change was discussed, including the impact of Artificial Intelligence and autonomous weapons systems, big data and biotechnology. The Secretary General stressed that effective defence and deterrence depend on the maintenance of NATO's technological edge and that future security depends on the Alliance's ability to adopt emerging technologies. As the world becomes more unpredictable, increased spending on defence is required, he said.

The Secretary General highlighted the important role parliamentarians play as the link between NATO and the citizens of NATO member states. Lastly, he addressed the ongoing situation in northern Syria and noted concerns about regional instability, escalating tensions, and human suffering. He underscored that, while Turkey has legitimate security concerns, is the only Ally exposed directly to the violence and turmoil in the Middle East, and hosts a significant number of refugees from Syria, Turkey must act with restraint and in coordination with other Allies to preserve the gains that have been made against Daesh, a common enemy. As he said, the international community must find a coordinated and sustainable strategy for dealing with returning foreign terrorist fighters. A question and answer period followed.

Mark Angel, NATO PA Treasurer, then delivered his financial reports and the NATO PA draft budget for 2020, which the Plenary adopted. NATO PA Committee resolutions were then presented by their respective rapporteurs, including Senator Day, and subsequently adopted. Lord Campbell of Pittenweem (United Kingdom) presented a draft of the revised Rules of Procedure, which the plenary adopted. The President closed the 2019 Annual Session by thanking the UK delegation as well as NATO PA Secretariat staff for their efforts in organizing the meeting.

OTHER MEETINGS

The Canadian delegation attended a briefing session offered by Canada's High Commissioner to the United Kingdom of Britain and Northern Ireland, Ambassador Janice Charette. Canada-UK relations, including economic and defence ties, were the focus of the discussions. Senator Day, leader of the Canadian delegation, as well as Senator Boisvenu, Senator Cordy, Senator Dalphond, Senator Greene, and Senator White attended the briefing session.

Senator Day also met with members of the Ukrainian delegation, who provided an update on recent steps that have been taken towards Euro-Atlantic integration, including the drafting and adoption of new laws related to reform. The Head of the Ukrainian delegation, Yehor Cherniev, told Senator Day that Ukraine has established a goal to reach NATO defence and security standards by 2020. The delegation expressed their appreciation for Canada's support in a number of areas. Senator Day reiterated Canada's support for Ukraine in the face of Russian aggression and encouraged Ukrainian parliamentarians to continue to make progress towards the goal of membership in the European Union and NATO.

Respectfully submitted,

Mr. Darren Fisher, M.P.
Vice-Chair of the Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association (NATO PA)

Travel Costs

ASSOCIATION	Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association
ACTIVITY	65th Annual Session
DESTINATION	London, United Kingdom
DATES	October 11-14, 2019
DELEGATION	
	Hon. Joseph Day, Senator, leader of the Canadian delegation
	Hon. Peter Boehm, Senator
SENATE	Hon. Pierre-Hugues Boisvenu, Senator
	Hon. Jane Cordy, Senator
	Hon. Pierre Dalphond, Senator
	Hon. Stephen Greene, Senator
	Hon. Vernon White, Senator
HOUSE OF COMMONS	
STAFF	Jean-François Pagé, Association Secretary Katherine Simonds, Association Advisor
TRANSPORTATION	\$25,368.75
ACCOMMODATION	\$15,076.46
PER DIEMS	\$8,800.52
TOTAL	\$49,245.73